

Determining the Impact of Eric Clapton on Music Using RDF Graphs

Selected Challenges of Semantics Across and Within Datasets

Ronald P. Reck, Kenneth B. Sall and Wendy A. Swanbeck



August 5, 2011
Montréal, Canada

2011 – Triples (RDF, NT, etc.)

Subject	Predicate	Object
Eric Clapton	Played with →	John Mayall
Eric Clapton	Played with →	Cream
Eric Clapton	Has Alternate Names →	"Clapton, Eric Patrick; Slowhand"@en
Eric Clapton	Played with →	Derek and the Dominos

Lofty Goal: Measuring a Musician's Impact

- Who has had the greatest “**impact**” on rock (or blues) music?
 - Conceptual vs. Technical
 - Empirical, repeatable procedure
 - Verifiable
 - In theory – Can we trust results?
 - In practice – Need to check (direct knowledge and other authoritative sources)
 - Compare to musician’s own recollections
 - Case study: “*Selected Challenges of Semantics Across and Within Datasets*”

Measuring a Musician's Impact – cont.

- A la “Six Degrees of Kevin Bacon”:
 - Which rock artist's extended graph has the most other artists in 2 degrees? 3? 4?
 - How many musicians are within 1 or 2 degrees of Eric Clapton?
 - Difficult to verify.
- Easy to think of two dozen interesting questions.
- Very hard to align to specific RDF properties (in selected datastores with certainty).

Problem Statements

- Which recording artist has directly played with the most musicians? (no genre)
 - Define “played with”: group, album, live performance, same show?
- Which recording artist was most active during a particular *decade*?
 - But how to define active? recordings ? concerts?
- Among all artists of a particular *genre*, who has played with the most other musicians?
 - But how to define genre (multiple similar terms)?

Problem Statements – cont.

- Impoverished data
 - Can we use our own knowledge of Eric Clapton to clarify some of the semantics behind some of the RDF data we encounter?

Data Sources - Wikipedia Infoboxes

Eric Clapton



Clapton on stage, Munich, Germany on 5 June 2010

Background information

Birth name	Eric Patrick Clapton
Also known as	Slowhand
Born	30 March 1945 (age 66) Ripley, Surrey, England
Genres	Rock, blues-rock, blues, psychedelic rock, hard rock
Occupations	Musician, songwriter, producer, artist
Instruments	Vocals, guitar
Years active	1962–present
Labels	Warner Bros., Reprise, Polydor, RSO, Atooi, Apple, Deram ^[1]
Associated acts	The Yardbirds, John Mayall & the Bluesbreakers, Powerhouse, Cream, Free Creek, The Dirty Mac, Blind Faith, J.J. Cale, The Plastic Ono Band, Delaney, Bonnie & Friends, Derek and the Dominos
Website	Official website

Notable instruments

See: [Guitars section](#)

Contents [hide]

- Usage
- For articles about individuals
- For articles about musical groups
- Parameters
 - name
 - image
 - alt
 - caption
 - image_size
 - landscape
 - background
 - birth_name
 - alias
 - birth_date
 - birth_place
 - origin
 - death_date
 - death_place
 - genre
 - occupation
 - instrument
 - years_active
 - label
 - associated_acts
 - url
 - current_members
 - past_members
 - notable_instruments
- Examples
 - For individual musicians
 - For groups or bands

Source: Wikipedia.
"Eric Clapton --
Wikipedia, The Free
Encyclopedia". 2011.

Wikipedia Infobox Markup

```
{{Use British English|date=August 2010}}{{Use dmy dates|date=October 2010}}
{{Infobox musical artist <!-- See Wikipedia:WikiProject_Musicians -->
| Name           = Eric Clapton
| Img            = Eric Clapton in concert.jpg
| Alias          = Slowhand
| Img_capt       = Clapton on stage, Munich, Germany on 5 June 2010
| Img_size       = 250
| Landscape      = Yes
| Background     = solo_singer
| Birth_name     = Eric Patrick Clapton
| Born           = {{Birth date and age|1945|3|30|df=y}}<br />[[Ripley, Surrey]], England
| Instrument     = [[Singing|Vocals]], [[guitar]]
| Genre          = [[Rock music|Rock]], [[blues rock]], [[psychedelic rock]], [[blues]], [[hard rock]], [[acid rock]]
| Occupation     = [[Musician]], [[songwriter]], [[Record producer|producer]], [[artist]]
| Years_active   = 1962–present
| Label          = [[Warner Bros. Records|Warner Bros.]], [[Reprise Records|Reprise]], [[Polydor Records|Polydor]], [[RSO
Records|RSO]], [[Atco Records|Atco]], [[Apple Records|Apple]], [[Deram]]<ref>{{cite web
| title          = Rock & Roll Library - Eric Clapton's Releases
| work           = List
| publisher      = Rock & Roll Library
| url            = http://www.rocklibrary.com/Library/qs/releases.aspx?id=de20a9f0-1c31-4632-a807-336d3a4c537b
| accessdate    = 25 August 2008}}</ref>
| Associated_acts = <!-- see: [[Template:Infobox_musical_artist#Associated_acts]]--> [[The Yardbirds]], [[John Mayall & the
Bluesbreakers]], [[Eric Clapton's Powerhouse|Powerhouse]], [[Cream (band)|Cream]], [[Free Creek (band)|Free Creek]], [[The Dirty
Mac]], [[Blind Faith]], [[J.J. Cale]], [[The Plastic Ono Band]], [[Delaney, Bonnie & Friends]], [[Derek and the Dominos]], [[The
Beatles]], [[Phil Collins]], [[The Rolling Stones]], [[Luciano Pavarotti]], [[The Band]], [[Freddie King]], [[B.B. King]]
| URL            = [http://www.ericclapton.com/ Official website]
| Notable_instruments = See: [[#Guitars|Guitars section]]<br />[[Blackie (guitar)|"Blackie": Fender Stratocaster]]<br
/>[[Brownie (guitar)|"Brownie": Fender Stratocaster]]<br />[[Gibson SG]]<br />[[Gibson ES-335]]<br />[[Gibson Les Paul]]
}})
```

Source: Wikipedia. "Eric Clapton -- Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia". 2011.

DBpedia NT Excerpt – Clapton Infobox

EC = <http://dbpedia.org/resource/Eric_Clapton>

Total Clapton triples: 5,064. Source: infobox_properties_en.nt: 160 EC's

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/name>> "Eric Clapton"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/id>> "618b6900-0618-4f1e-b835-bccb17f84294"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/wikiPageUsesTemplate>> <<http://dbpedia.org/resource/Template:Persondata>> .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/placeOfBirth>> "Ripley, Surrey, England"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/dateOfBirth>> "1945"^^<<http://www.w3.org/2001/XMLSchema#int>> .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/shortDescription>> "Grammy Award winning English guitarist, singer and composer"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/alternativeNames>> "Clapton, Eric Patrick; Slowhand"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/name>> "Clapton, Eric"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/wikiPageUsesTemplate>> <http://dbpedia.org/resource/Template:Template_group> .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/title>> "Associated bands"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/associatedActs>> "The Yardbirds, John Mayall & the Bluesbreakers, Powerhouse, Cream, Free Creek, Dire Straits, George Harrison, The Dirty Mac, Blind Faith, Freddie King, Phil Collins, J.J. Cale, The Plastic Ono Band, Delaney, Bonnie & Friends, Derek and the Dominos, T.D.F., Jeff Beck, Paul McCartney, Steve Winwood, B.B. King, The Beatles, The Band"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/label>> "Warner Bros., Reprise, Polydor, RSO, Atco, Apple, Deram"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/yearsActive>> "1962\u2013present"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/occupation>> "Musician, singer-songwriter, artist"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/genre>> "Rock, blues-rock, psychedelic rock, hard rock"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/wikiPageUsesTemplate>> <http://dbpedia.org/resource/Template:Musicbrainz_artist> .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/wikiPageUsesTemplate>> <<http://dbpedia.org/resource/Template:Listen>> .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/format>> "Ogg"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/description>> "27.0"^^<<http://dbpedia.org/datatype/second>> .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/title>> "\"Layla\""@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/filename>> "Layla sample 1.ogg"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/wikiPageUsesTemplate>> <http://dbpedia.org/resource/Template:Infobox_musical_artist> .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/notableInstruments>> <http://dbpedia.org/resource/Gibson_ES-335> .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/notableInstruments>> "See: Guitars section"@en .

EC <<http://dbpedia.org/property/url>> "Official website"@en .

Data Source - DBpedia

About: [Eric Clapton](#)

An Entity of Type : [musical artist](#), from Named Graph : <http://dbpedia.org>, within Data Space : [dbpedia.org](#)



Eric Patrick Clapton, CBE (born 30 March 1945) is an English blues-rock guitarist and singer-songwriter. Clapton is the only person who has been inducted into the Rock and Roll Hall of Fame three times; as a solo performer, as well as a member of rock bands the Yardbirds and Cream. Throughout his career, Clapton has been viewed by critics and fans alike as one of the most important and influential guitarists of all time, Clapton was ranked fourth in Rolling Stone

Property	Value
dbpedia-owl:abstract	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Eric Patrick Clapton, CBE ist ein englischer Blues- und Rock-Gitarrist und -Sänger. Er ist mehrfacher Grammygewinner und dreifaches Mitglied der „Rock and Roll Hall of Fame“. Clapton prägte die Entwicklung des Bluesrocks seit den 1960er Jahren wesentlich mit und gilt als einer der bedeutendsten Gitarristen. Auf der Liste der 100 Greatest Guitarists of All Time der amerikanischen Musikzeitschrift Rolling Stone findet sich Clapton auf Rang 4.Eric Patrick Clapton, CBE (born 30 March 1945) is an English blues-rock guitarist and singer-songwriter. Clapton is the only
dbpedia-owl:alias	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Slowhand
dbpedia-owl:associatedBand	<ul style="list-style-type: none">dbpedia:The_Yardbirdsdbpedia:Jeff_Beckdbpedia:B.B._Kingdbpedia:Eric_Clapton's_Powerhousedbpedia:The_Dirty_Macdbpedia:George_Harrisondbpedia:The_Beatlesdbpedia:Cream_(band)dbpedia:The_Banddbpedia:John_Mayall_&_the_Bluesbreakersdbpedia:Phil_Collinsdbpedia:Paul_McCartneydbpedia:Freddie_Kingdbpedia:Dire_Straitsdbpedia:Blind_Faithdbpedia:Steve_Winwooddbpedia:Derek_and_the_Dominosdbpedia:Free_Creek_(band)dbpedia:The_Plastic_Ono_Banddbpedia:Delaney,_Bonnie_&_Friendsdbpedia:J.J._Caledbpedia:X-sample
dbpedia-owl:associatedMusicalArtist	<ul style="list-style-type: none">dbpedia:The_Yardbirdsdbpedia:Jeff_Beckdbpedia:B.B._Kingdbpedia:Eric_Clapton's_Powerhousedbpedia:The_Dirty_Macdbpedia:George_Harrison

Source:

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Eric_Clapton [redirects]

Data Source: MusicBrainz

- MBID is a 36 character Universally Unique Identifier permanently assigned to each MusicBrainz database entity, such as:
 - Artists
 - Release Groups, Releases
 - Disc IDs
 - Recordings [tracks]
 - Labels
 - Works
 - Relationships [links]
- Eric Clapton's MBID and Artist page:
 - 618b6900-0618-4f1e-b835-bccb17f84294
 - <http://musicbrainz.org/artist/618b6900-0618-4f1e-b835-bccb17f84294>

MusicBrainz – Previous Clapton page

MusicBrainz

Hide side bar

MusicBrainz Sites

- Master Server
- Find a Mirror
- MetaBrainz
- Brainz Blog
- Mailing Lists
- Forums
- Chat Logs
- Wiki
- Stuff to Buy
- Bug Tracker

Not logged in

- Login
- Create account
- Forgot Password
- Dashboard
- Donate!

Search

Artists

Advanced Query »

Direct search »

Other searches »

Top Voters

- chabreyf... 1042
- salo.rock 920
- murdos 643
- MeinDummy 515
- gswanjord 411
- more »

Server Stats

- Artists 617024
- Releases 910722
- Tracks 10736645
- Labels 49882

About **News** **Products** **Search** **Edit** **Account** **Collection** **Contribute** **Help** **Feedback**

Search | Search Links | Search Edits | Browse Artists | Browse Releases | Browse Labels | Browser Search Plugins

Eric Clapton (Average rating: 4.53, rated 13 times)

Born: 1945-03-30, Type: Person, Default data quality
Clapton, Eric

Info: [[Link to this](#) | [Details](#) | [Aliases](#) | [Tags](#) | [Release groups](#) | [Releases](#) | [Appears on](#) | [Similar artists](#) | [Search google](#)]

Edit: [[Log in to edit this](#)]

Artist tags: blues, blues rock, hard rock, pop, rock, more... [[Log in to tag this](#)]

Eric Clapton:

- collaborated on [B.B. King & Eric Clapton](#), [Bob Dylan, Roger McGuinn, Tom Petty, Neil Young, Eric Clapton & George Harrison](#), [Elton John & Eric Clapton](#), [Eric Clapton & David Sanborn](#) ...
- collaborated on [The Dirty Mac](#) on 1968-12-11
- has a BBC Music page at <http://www.bbc.co.uk/music/artists/618b6900-0618...> [info]

28 relationships not shown. [View all relationships](#) ...

[[View relationships](#)]

Yellow highlights indicate pending changes.

Showing single artist release groups. [Show various artist release groups.](#)

Non-Album Tracks

Year	Title	Releases
-	[non-album tracks]	1

Albums

Year	Title	Releases
1970	Eric Clapton	3
1974	461 Ocean Boulevard	5

Previous Source: <http://musicbrainz.org/artist/618b6900-0618-4f1e-b835-bccb17f84294.html>. This 3/21/11 view is no longer possible, AFAIK.

MusicBrainz – Clapton “Artist” page Now

MusicBrainz search Artist Search

About Blog Products Search Documentation Contact Us Log In Create Account

Eric Clapton

~ Person

Overview Releases Recordings Works Relationships Aliases Tags Details Edit

Page 1 of 4

Album

Year	Title	Artist	Rating	Releases
1970	Eric Clapton	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	5
1974	461 Ocean Boulevard	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	10
1975	There's One in Every Crowd	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	4
1976	No Reason to Cry	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	3
1977	Slowhand	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	11
1978	Backless	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	3
1981	Another Ticket	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	4
1983	Money and Cigarettes	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	2
1985	Behind the Sun	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	3
1986	Post Cricket Jam	Eric Clapton & Stan Webb's Chicken Shack	★★★★★	1
1986	August	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	3
1989	Journeyman	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	4
1990	Rarities	Eric Clapton & The Yardbirds	★★★★★	1
1993	Stages	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	1
1994	From the Cradle	Eric Clapton	★★★★★	3

Artist information

Sort name: Clapton, Eric
Type: Person
Gender: Male
Born: 1945-03-30 (66 years ago)
Country: United Kingdom
IPI code: 00041122734

Rating
★★★★★ (see all ratings)

Tags
[blues](#), [blues rock](#), [hard rock](#), [pop](#), [rock](#), [more...](#)

Editing
■ [Log in to edit](#)

External links

- [Official homepage](#)
- [BBC Music](#)
- [Discogs](#)
- [MusicMoz](#)
- [my ericclapton](#)
- [W en: Eric Clapton](#)

Last updated on 2011-05-19 20:35 UTC

Source: <http://musicbrainz.org/artist/618b6900-0618-4f1e-b835-bccb17f84294>

Permanent link.

Last updated: 2011-05-19 20:35 UTC

MusicBrainz – WS result 461 Ocean Blvd.

```

- <rdf:RDF>
  - <mq:Result>
    <mq:status>OK</mq:status>
    - <mm:albumList>
      - <rdf:Bag>
        <rdf:li rdf:resource="http://musicbrainz.org/mm-2.1/album/1301e027-b038-4017-9b4c-7655bff78f6b"/>
      </rdf:Bag>
    </mm:albumList>
  </mq:Result>
- <mm:Album rdf:about="http://musicbrainz.org/mm-2.1/album/1301e027-b038-4017-9b4c-7655bff78f6b">
  <dc:title>461 Ocean Boulevard</dc:title>
  <dc:creator rdf:resource="http://musicbrainz.org/mm-2.1/artist/618b6900-0618-4f1e-b835-bccb17f84294"/>
  - <mm:cdindexidList>
    - <rdf:Bag>
      <rdf:li rdf:resource="http://musicbrainz.org/mm-2.1/cdindex/y72NfVvPOq352_SUXFjSzcgljM0-"/>
      <rdf:li rdf:resource="http://musicbrainz.org/mm-2.1/cdindex/mym7chOZfDoF8RJ1m7ST6JnSO8A-"/>
      <rdf:li rdf:resource="http://musicbrainz.org/mm-2.1/cdindex/ZLPCG1qHanPJRPUVTQOLgneuukQ-"/>
      <rdf:li rdf:resource="http://musicbrainz.org/mm-2.1/cdindex/evjs.Kx8e_IPJtopLpFHiZ27YgU-"/>
    </rdf:Bag>
  </mm:cdindexidList>
  <mm:releaseType rdf:resource="http://musicbrainz.org/mm/mm-2.1#TypeAlbum"/>
  <mm:releaseStatus rdf:resource="http://musicbrainz.org/mm/mm-2.1#StatusOfficial"/>
  + <mm:releaseDateList></mm:releaseDateList>
  <az:Asin>B000001F3N</az:Asin>
</mm:Album>
</rdf:RDF>

```

Previous Source: <http://musicbrainz.org/mm-2.1/album/1301e027-b038-4017-9b4c-7655bff78f6b>
 Permanent Release Link now: [release, not album]
<http://musicbrainz.org/release/1301e027-b038-4017-9b4c-7655bff78f6b>

MusicBrainz – WS 2 for 461 Ocean Blvd.

```
- <metadata>
- <release id="1301e027-b038-4017-9b4c-7655bff78f6b">
  <title>461 Ocean Boulevard</title>
  <status>Official</status>
  <quality>normal</quality>
+ <text-representation></text-representation>
- <artist-credit>
  - <name-credit>
    - <artist id="618b6900-0618-4f1e-b835-bccb17f84294">
      <name>Eric Clapton</name>
      <sort-name>Clapton, Eric</sort-name>
    </artist>
  </name-credit>
</artist-credit>
  <date>1974</date>
  <country>US</country>
  <asin>B000001F3N</asin>
+ <label-info-list count="1"></label-info-list>
- <medium-list count="1">
  - <medium>
    <position>1</position>
    <format>Vinyl</format>
    <disc-list count="0"/>
  - <track-list count="10" offset="0">
    - <track>
      <position>1</position>
      <length>293200</length>
    - <recording id="10aae51f-f253-42c4-8af8-5673da1c98e6">
      <title>Motherless Children</title>
      <length>293200</length>
```

Source as of 7/24/11:

<http://musicbrainz.org/ws/2/release/1301e027-b038-4017-9b4c-7655bff78f6b?inc=artist-credits+labels+discids+recordings>

Freebase Triples – Tab Separated Values

```

1 musical_group.tsv:
2   Blind Faith   /m/0197vy /m/01wvwr8,/m/01tfhrr,/m/01tfhry,/m/01tfhrk
3   Derek and the Dominos /m/01jjpl4 /m/0bd3rky,/m/0bd3y2g,/m/01tj3yf,/m/01w3ths,/m/01t73cp
4   Cream        /m/0d_yq /m/03brncc,/m/0dq6698,/m/0kpxvh,/m/01tly45,/m/0dZRptm,/m/0kpxvz
5
6 group_membership.tsv: [search for "Derek and the Dominos"]
7   Line 15951:    /m/01tj3yf Duane Allman   Derek and the Dominos
8   Line 41400:    /m/0bd3y2g Bob Whitlock   Derek and the Dominos
9   Line 52281:    /m/0bd3rky Carl Radle     Derek and the Dominos
10  Line 52759:    /m/01t73cp Eric Clapton   Derek and the Dominos
11  Line 75436:    /m/01w3ths Jim Gordon     Derek and the Dominos
12  =====
13 group_member.tsv:  [search for each of the 5 unique IDs above;
14                   matches are to part of the comma-separated string]
15  Line 4388: Duane Allman /m/01qyy3 /m/040qwdk,/m/043f3g9,/m/043f3g4,/m/01tj3ym,/m/01tj3yf,
16  Line 8987: Bob Whitlock /m/03h_kgb /m/0bd3y2g,/m/0bd4wpy Keyboard instrument
17  Line 12298: Carl Radle /m/03h_lb6 /m/0bd36f0,/m/0bd3rky Bass guitar
18  Line 95599: Eric Clapton /m/02qwg
19  /m/01wyq91,/m/01x2v1x,/m/043ds06,/m/01tjv90,/m/03brncc,/m/04d37n4,/m/01v977y,/m/045z2rs,/m/
20  01t7ctr,/m/04d37mg,/m/04d37mz,/m/043dr_x,/m/04d37n9,/m/040jgbb,/m/04d37mn,/m/01wjb4p,/m/08c
21  ds01,/m/043dr_r Slide guitar,Guitar,Fender Stratocaster
22  Line 20786: Jim Gordon /m/0409zb /m/01w3tj4,/m/01w3thz,/m/01w3ths,/m/0bd3nvq Percuss

```

Freebase – RDF

Source: http://rdf.freebase.com/rdf/en.eric_clapton

Reachable from bottom link from

http://www.freebase.com/view/en/eric_clapton

– <rdf:RDF>

- <fb:base.popstra.canoodled rdf:about="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/m.0652sw0">
 - <fb:base.popstra.canoodled.participant rdf:resource="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/en.alicia_witt"/>
 - <fb:base.popstra.canoodled.participant>
 - + <fb:award.award_winner rdf:about="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/en.eric_clapton"></fb:award.award_winner>
 - </fb:base.popstra.canoodled.participant>
 - <fb:base.popstra.sww_base.source>
 - <http://www.whosdatedwho.com/celebrities/people/dating/alicia-witt.htm>
 - </fb:base.popstra.sww_base.source>
 - <fb:base.popstra.canoodled.date>1998-01-01T00:00:00.000Z</fb:base.popstra.canoodled.date>
 - </fb:base.popstra.canoodled>
 - <fb:common.webpage rdf:about="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/m.01t4f28">
 - <fb:type.object.name xml:lang="en"><http://www.discogs.com/artist/Eric+Clapton></fb:type.object.name>
 - <fb:common.webpage.resource rdf:resource="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/uri.http\$003A\$002F\$002Fwww\$002Ediscogs\$002Ecom\$002Fartist\$002Feric\$002Bclapton"/>
 - <fb:common.webpage.category rdf:resource="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/en.topic_webpage"/>
 - <fb:common.webpage.topic rdf:resource="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/en.eric_clapton"/>
 - <fb:common.webpage.uri><http://www.discogs.com/artist/Eric+Clapton></fb:common.webpage.uri>
 - </fb:common.webpage>
 - <fb:base.popstra.support rdf:about="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/m.064cvh7">
 - <fb:base.popstra.support.supporter rdf:resource="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/en.eric_clapton"/>
 - <fb:base.popstra.support.supported_organization rdf:resource="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/m.0646426"/>
 - <fb:base.popstra.sww_base.source>
 - <http://www.looktothestars.org/celebrity/618-eric-clapton>
 - </fb:base.popstra.sww_base.source>
 - <rdf:type rdf:resource="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/base.popstra.sww_base"/>
 - </fb:base.popstra.support>
 - <fb:base.popstra.canoodled rdf:about="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/m.0652sjy">
 - <fb:base.popstra.canoodled.participant rdf:resource="http://rdf.freebase.com/ns/en.eric_clapton"/>

Methodology: Development Environment

- Ubuntu Linux
- OpenLink Virtuoso Universal Server
 - RDF datastore and query engine/SPARQL endpoint
- Drupal 6.18
 - testing and sharing queries

Methodology: RDF Visualization

- HTML form with JQuery and AJAX, POST
- Convert XML query results to Graphviz input format DOT language.
- Output SVG

Drupal Query Interface

www.vocabutek.com

www.vocabutek.com

DBPedia queries

DBP Awards

KENS

DEB

Bacon

Aaron

kensall

- Visualize a query
- AJAX test
- Color Picker Example
- Financial Search
- Import external RDF vocabulary
- My account
- SPARQL query
- Search
- ▶ Create content
- clapton svg
- ▶ Administer
- Log out

Home ▶ see Eric Clapton properties and values

see Eric Clapton properties and values

View

Edit

Export

Devel

Title: *

see Eric Clapton properties and values

– ▶ Menu settings

Query: *

```
select ?properties ?values {  
<http://dbpedia.org/resource/Eric_Clapton>  
  ?properties ?values  
}
```

Drupal Query Interface: Result

www.vocabutek.com

DBpedia queries

DBP Awards

KENS

DEB

Bacon

Aaron

kensall

- Visualize a query
- AJAX test
- Color Picker Example
- Financial Search
- Import external RDF vocabulary
- My account
- SPARQL query
- Search
- Create content
- clapton svg
- Administer
- Log out

Home

see Eric Clapton properties and values

View

Edit

Export

Devel

Submitted by rreck on Sat, 2011-02-19 15:21

properties	values
http://www.w3.org/1999/02/22-rdf-syntax-ns#type	http://www.w3.org/2002/07/owl#Thing
http://www.w3.org/1999/02/22-rdf-syntax-ns#type	http://dbpedia.org/ontology/Artist
http://www.w3.org/1999/02/22-rdf-syntax-ns#type	http://dbpedia.org/ontology/MusicalArtist
http://www.w3.org/1999/02/22-rdf-syntax-ns#type	http://dbpedia.org/ontology/Person
http://purl.org/dc/terms/subject	http://dbpedia.org/resource/Category:Commanders_of_the_Order_of_the_British_Empire
http://purl.org/dc/terms/subject	http://dbpedia.org/resource/Category:1990s_singers
http://purl.org/dc/terms/subject	http://dbpedia.org/resource/Category:People_self-identifying_as_alcoholics
http://purl.org/dc/terms/subject	http://dbpedia.org/resource/Category:2010s_singers
http://purl.org/dc/terms/subject	http://dbpedia.org/resource/Category:Electric_blues_musicians

Drupal Query Interface: Menus

The screenshot shows the website www.vocabutek.com with a navigation bar containing tabs for DBpedia queries, DBP Awards, KENS, DEB, Bacon, and Aaron. A sidebar on the left lists various query examples under the name 'kensall', including 'Visualize a query', 'AJAX test', 'Color Picker Example', 'Financial Search', 'Import external RDF vocabulary', 'My account', 'SPARQL query', 'Search', 'Create content', 'clapton svg', 'Administer', and 'Log out'. The main content area displays a search result for 'Eric Clapton' with a dropdown menu. The menu items are: 'MB Complex Queries', 'MB Eric Clapton Info w. MBID', 'DBP All about Object Clapton', 'DBP Who played in John Mayall's band?', 'EC associatedBands - 2 levels', and 'UNION example'. The 'DBP All Clapton as Subject' option is highlighted in blue. A tooltip above this option reads 'Subject Eric Clapton properties and values'. Below the menu, a table of properties and values is visible, with a 'Devel' button and a 'Title' column. The table contains rows for 'DBP Clapton's Layla details', 'DBP Concert for Bangladesh stars w/Clapton', and '<?p>Eric_Clapton>'. The overall interface is dark-themed.

Graphviz Query Entry

The screenshot shows the website **www.vocabutek.com** with a navigation bar containing links for DBpedia queries, DBP Awards, KENS, DEB, Bacon, and Aaron. The user is logged in as **kensall**. The main heading is **Visualize a Query**, with sub-buttons for View, Edit, Export, and Devel. The query input field contains: `SELECT DISTINCT ?object WHERE {<http://dbpedia.org/resourc`. The subject input field contains `Eric_Clapton`. A **Visualize!** button is present. Below, under **Example queries that work**, two queries are shown. Query 1 is: `SELECT DISTINCT ?object WHERE { <http://dbpedia.org/resource/Eric_Clapton> <http://dbpedia.org/ontology/associatedBand> ?object . } ORDER BY ?object`. Query 2 is: `SELECT DISTINCT ?predicate WHERE {?s ?predicate ?o. FILTER regex(?o, "Eric Clapton"). } ORDER BY ?predicate`. Both queries have a **Subject: Eric_Clapton** label.

Graphviz Visualization Result

www.vocabutek.com

DBpedia queries DBP Awards KENS DEB Bacon Aaron

kensall

- o Visualize a query
- o AJAX test
- o Color Picker Example
- o Financial Search
- o Import external RDF vocabulary
- o My account
- o SPARQL query
- o Search
- o Create content
- o clapton svg
- o Administer
- o Log out

Home

Visualize a Query

View Edit Export Devel

Query: `*edia.org/ontology/associatedBand?who. } ORDER BY ?who`

Subject:

Visualize!

```
graph LR; Eric_Clapton -- who --> B.B._King; Eric_Clapton -- who --> Blind_Faith; Eric_Clapton -- who --> Cream_(band); Eric_Clapton -- who --> Delaney,_Bonnie_&_Friends; Eric_Clapton -- who --> Derek_and_the_Dominos;
```

The visualization shows a central node 'Eric_Clapton' connected to five other nodes representing bands. Each connection is labeled 'who'. The bands are: B.B. King, Blind Faith, Cream (band), Delaney, Bonnie & Friends, and Derek and the Dominos.

Challenges and Results: 23 Predicates

Predicates for Which Clapton is the **(only) Object**

<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/artist>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/associatedBand>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/associatedMusicalArtist>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/composer>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/musicComposer>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/musicalArtist>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/musicalBand>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/partner>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/producer>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/spouse>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/starring>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/wikiPageDisambiguates>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/writer>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/associatedActs>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/before>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/currentMembers>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/music>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/pastMembers>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/producer>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/spouse>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/starring>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/writer>
<http://www.w3.org/2002/07/owl#sameAs>

Challenges and Results: 44 Predicates

Predicates for Which Clapton is **(all or part of) the Object**

<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/abstract>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/alias>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/after>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/album>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/alias>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/allWriting>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/altArtist>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/artist>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/associatedActs>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/aux>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/before>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/caption>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/chronology>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/composer>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/cover>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/description>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/extra>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/founders>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/fromAlbum>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/img>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/imgCapt>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/label>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/lastAlbum>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/lyrics>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/music>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/musicalguests>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/name>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/namedAfter>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/nextAlbum>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/note>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/notes>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/partner>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/pastMembers>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/producer>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/recordedBy>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/shortDescription>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/starring>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/text>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/thisAlbum>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/title>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/writer>
<http://purl.org/dc/elements/1.1/title>
<http://www.w3.org/2000/01/rdf-schema#label>
<http://xmlns.com/foaf/0.1/name>

Challenges and Results: 30 Properties

Clapton's Properties in **Combined Datastore** (DBpedia and MusicBrainz)

<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/artist>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/associatedBand>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/associatedMusicalArtist>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/composer>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/musicComposer>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/musicalArtist>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/musicalBand>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/partner>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/producer>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/spouse>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/starring>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/wikiPageDisambiguates>
<http://dbpedia.org/ontology/writer>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/associatedActs>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/before>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/currentMembers>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/music>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/pastMembers>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/producer>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/spouse>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/starring>
<http://dbpedia.org/property/writer>
<http://musicbrainz.org/ar/ar-1.0#composer>
<http://musicbrainz.org/ar/ar-1.0#instrument>
<http://musicbrainz.org/ar/ar-1.0#performer>
<http://musicbrainz.org/ar/ar-1.0#producer>
<http://musicbrainz.org/ar/ar-1.0#toArtist>
<http://musicbrainz.org/ar/ar-1.0#vocal>
<http://purl.org/dc/elements/1.1/creator>
<http://www.w3.org/2002/07/owl#sameAs>

Challenges and Results: Associations

- How to determine who played with an artist? Which properties apply?
 - <http://dbpedia.org/property/associatedActs>
 - <http://dbpedia.org/ontology/associatedBand>
 - <http://dbpedia.org/ontology/associatedMusicalArtist>
 - ~~<http://dbpedia.org/property/starring>~~
 - ~~<http://dbpedia.org/property/musicalguests>~~

Results: property/associatedActs

- Wikipedia:
 - "The Yardbirds, John Mayall & the Bluesbreakers, Powerhouse, Cream, Free Creek, The Dirty Mac, Blind Faith, J.J. Cale, The Plastic Ono Band, Delaney, Bonnie & Friends, Derek and the Dominos".
- SPARQL Query:
 - "The Yardbirds, John Mayall & the Bluesbreakers, Powerhouse, Cream, Free Creek, Dire Straits, George Harrison, The Dirty Mac, Blind Faith, Freddie King, Phil Collins, J.J. Cale, The Plastic Ono Band, Delaney, Bonnie & Friends, Derek and the Dominos, T.D.F., Jeff Beck, Paul McCartney, Steve Winwood, B.B. King, The Beatles, The Band"@en

Results: Association Ontology Mapping

- Further investigation pointed to [DBpedia Infobox Mappings](#):
 - [ontology mapping for the Infobox for Musical Artists](#).
- Infobox template property Associated_acts maps to two ontology properties
 - <http://dbpedia.org/ontology/associatedBand>
 - <http://dbpedia.org/ontology/associatedMusicalArtist>

Results: ontology/associatedBand, associatedMusicalArtist

But what about Steve Winwood and T.D.F from slide #29?

http://dbpedia.org/resource/B.B._King

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Blind_Faith

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Cream_%28band%29

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Delaney,_Bonnie_&_Friends

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Derek_and_the_Dominos

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Dire_Straits

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Eric_Clapton%27s_Powerhouse

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Freddie_King

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Free_Creek_%28band%29

http://dbpedia.org/resource/George_Harrison

http://dbpedia.org/resource/J.J._Cale

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Jeff_Beck

http://dbpedia.org/resource/John_Mayall_&_the_Bluesbreakers

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Paul_McCartney

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Phil_Collins

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Steve_Winwood

http://dbpedia.org/resource/The_Band

http://dbpedia.org/resource/The_Beatles

http://dbpedia.org/resource/The_Dirty_Mac

http://dbpedia.org/resource/The_Plastic_Ono_Band

http://dbpedia.org/resource/The_Yardbirds

<http://dbpedia.org/resource/X-sample>

Challenges and Results: Birthdays

```
DEFINE input:same-as "yes"
```

```
select ?musician ?DBPdate ?MBdate {
```

```
  ?s <http://www.w3.org/1999/02/22-rdf-syntax-ns#type>  
  <http://dbpedia.org/ontology/MusicalArtist>.
```

```
?s <http://dbpedia.org/ontology/birthDate> ?DBPdate .
```

```
?s <http://musicbrainz.org/mm/mm-2.1#beginDate> ?MBdate.
```

```
?s <http://www.w3.org/2000/01/rdf-schema#label> ?musician.
```

```
FILTER (str(?MBdate) != str (?DBPdate))
```

```
}
```

```
ORDER BY ?musician
```

Results: Birthdays: > 1000 Discrepancies

musician	DBPdate	MBdate	
50 Cent	1975-07-06	1976-07-06	
Andy Partridge	1953-11-11	1953-12-11	
Astrud Gilberto	1940-03-29	1940-03-30	
Blind Willie Johnson	1897-01-22	1902-00-00	[5 year difference]
Blind Willie McTell	1898-05-05	1901-05-05	[3 year difference]
Carl Perkins	1932-04-09	1928-08-16	[4 year difference]
Courtney Love	1964-07-09	1990-00-00	[extremely different!]
David Lee Roth	1954-10-10	1955-10-10	
Eddie Van Halen	1955-01-26	1956-01-26	
Edgar Winter	1947-12-28	1946-12-28	
Five for Fighting	1965-01-07	1997-00-00	[extremely different!]
Frankie Valli	1934-05-03	1937-05-03	[3 year difference]
George Harrison	1943-02-25	1943-02-24	
Jennifer Lopez	1969-07-24	1970-07-24	

Challenges: It's Still Rock 'n Roll to Me

- 2,887 musical genres
- 330 contain "rock" in their label
 - Aboriginal_rock to Zulu_rock
 - Concept of "rock and roll music" : 18 IRIs

Challenges: It's Still Rock 'n Roll to Me

```
SELECT DISTINCT (?genre)
{
  ?album <http://dbpedia.org/ontology/genre> ?genre.
  ?album <http://www.w3.org/1999/02/22-rdf-syntax-
ns#type> <http://dbpedia.org/ontology/Album>.
  FILTER regex (?genre, "[Rr]ock") .
  FILTER regex (?genre, "[Rr]oll") .
}
ORDER BY ?genre
```

Results: It's Still Rock 'n Roll to Me

http://dbpedia.org/resource/British_Rock_and_Roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Real_Rock_and_Roll

<http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock%27n%27Roll>

<http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock%27n%27roll>

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock%27n_roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_%27N%27_Roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_%27n%27_Roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_%27n%27_roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_%27n_Roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_&_Roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_&_roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_N%27_Roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_and_Roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_and_Roll_music

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_and_roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_n%27_Roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Rock_n_Roll

http://dbpedia.org/resource/Spanish_language_rock_and_roll

Advantages of Our Approach

- No execution timeout
- Higher limits
- Direct access to raw RDF at command line level
- Collaborative SPARQL development for saving queries in Drupal
- More precise SPARQL timing metrics
- Test harness for repeatedly running the same query
- Examination of error messages

Disadvantages of Our Approach

- Static datastore of dynamic sources
- Limited knowledge of inner workings or planned changes

Limitations and Further Efforts

- Data Inconsistencies
 - Errors of omission - what if Eric Clapton were to enter his own data about himself?
 - Poor data curating – extraction process
 - Erroneous data - unsubstantiated facts
 - Unclear semantics – considerable ambiguity
- Need for further RDF visualization work
- Need to address more of the original problems

Future: Put the LOD Right on Me

- Linking Open Data
- Demos including DBpedia and MusicBrainz
- DBpedia Extended Datasets
 - for MusicBrainz and Freebase
- Music Ontology
 - especially MusicArtist, musicbrainz_guid and supporting_musician

Late Breaking Developments

- DBpedia Live announced July 9, 2011
- Learning SPARQL: Querying and Updating with SPARQL 1.1
 - very new book by Bob DuCharme (July 2011)
- Semantic Web for the Working Ontologist, Second Edition: Effective Modeling in RDFS and OWL
 - Dean Allemang, James Hendler (June 2011)

Recommendations

- Publish example SPARQL queries
 - Not just data and endpoints
- Provide detailed explanation of
 - IRI conventions
 - property semantics
- Include examples of intersecting graphs from other music-oriented sites

Conclusions

- Significant challenges regarding consistency of data sources and interpretation of semantics for properties of musical artists.
 - Similar problems in other large community-entered datasets of relatively low quality.
- “Normalize” or decrease spurious diversity not intended as semantic distinction.
- “Impact” = weighted measurement of several variables (subjective):
 - Bands, songs, albums, years active
 - Frequency of airplay, number of covers, concerts, people who recognize their name, chart success

And One More Thing...

- “In an era of iTunes and Amazon, Spotify and Pandora, album sales don’t tell you what they used to. With so many routes to our eardrums, **how do we measure the actual popularity of pop music?** It’s something various companies are scrambling to figure out.”
- **“Album sales as representative of the success of artists is a failing metric...”**

http://www.washingtonpost.com/lifestyle/style/whos-on-top-in-music-its-gotten-hard-to-say/2011/06/27/gIQAWF9gZI_story.html

References

- [\[Auer and Lehmann 2007\]](#) Auer, Sören; Lehmann, Jens: What Have Innsbruck and Leipzig in Common? Extracting Semantics from Wiki Content. ISBN-13: 978-3-540-72666-1. Springer Verlag. © 2007. Lecture Notes in Computer Science, 2007, Volume 4519/2007, pp. 503-517, DOI: 10.1007/978-3-540-72667-8_36. <http://www.springerlink.com/content/3131t21p634191n2/> and <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.71.1314&rep=rep1&type=pdf>.
- [\[Auer et al 2007\]](#) Auer, Sören; Bizer, Christian; Kobilarov, Georgi; Lehmann, Jens; Cyganiak, Richard; Ives, Zachary: DBpedia: A Nucleus for a Web of Open Data. ISBN-13: 978-3-540-76297-3. Springer Verlag. © 2007. Lecture Notes in Computer Science, 2007, Volume 4825/2007, pp. 722-735, DOI: 10.1007/978-3-540-76298-0_52. <http://www.springerlink.com/content/rm32474088w54378/> and <http://www.informatik.uni-leipzig.de/~auer/publication/dbpedia.pdf>.
- [\[Allemang and Hendler 2008\]](#) Allemang, Dean; Hendler, James A.: Semantic Web for the Working Ontologist: Effective Modeling in RDFS and OWL. ISBN-13: 978-0-12-373556-0. Elsevier Inc. © 2008. <http://www.workingontologist.org/index.html>
- [\[Bacon\]](#) Six Degrees of Kevin Bacon. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Six_Degrees_of_Kevin_Bacon
- [Butcher 2010] Butcher, Matt et al. Drupal 7 Module Development. ISBN-10: 1849511160. First edition. Packt Publishing © 2010. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://www.amazon.com/Drupal-Module-Development-Matt-Butcher/dp/1849511160/>
- [\[Clapton\]](#) Eric Clapton's Wikipedia page. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Eric_clapton
- [Clapton FAQ] Eric Clapton Frequently Asked Questions, part of The Eric Clapton Fan Club Magazine. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://www.whereseric.com/eric-clapton-faq>
- [\[DBpedia Dataset\]](#) The DBpedia Dataset. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://wiki.dbpedia.org/Datasets>
- [\[DBpedia Ontology\]](#) The DBpedia Ontology. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://wiki.dbpedia.org/Ontology>
- [\[DBpedia Release\]](#) DBpedia 3.6 released. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://blog.dbpedia.org/2011/01/17/dbpedia-36-released/>.
- [Feigenbaum and Prud'hommeaux 2008] SPARQL By Example - A Tutorial. [online] [cited 08 Apr 2011]. Feigenbaum, Lee and Prud'hommeaux, Eric. Cambridge Semantics, 2008. Updated 2011-01-25. <http://www.cambridgesemantics.com/2008/09/sparql-by-example/>
- [Feigenbaum 2008] SPARQL by Example: The Cheat Sheet. [online] [cited 08 Apr 2011]. Feigenbaum, Lee. Cambridge Semantics, 2008. <http://www.slideshare.net/LeeFeigenbaum/sparql-cheat-sheet>
- [\[Frame 1983\]](#) Peter Frame's Rock Family Trees. [online and 3 books]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://www.familyofrock.com/browse/details/trees.html>
- [\[Freebase\]](#) Freebase home page. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://www.freebase.com/>
- [Freebase Data Dumps] Freebase Data Dumps. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. http://wiki.freebase.com/wiki/Data_dumps/
- [\[Graphviz\]](#) Graphviz home page. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://www.graphviz.org/>
- [\[MQL\]](#) Metaweb Query Language. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://wiki.freebase.com/wiki/MQL>
- [\[MusicBrainz\]](#) MusicBrainz home page. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://musicbrainz.org/>
- [Newman 2010] Newman, Mark. Networks - An Introduction. ISBN-10: 9780199206650. First edition. Oxford University Press, USA © 2010. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://www.amazon.com/Networks-Introduction-Mark-Newman/dp/0199206651/>
- [\[OpenCyc for the Semantic Web\]](#) OpenCyc for the Semantic Web. [online]. [Cited 26 Jun 2011]. <http://sw.opencyc.org/>
- [\[Six Degrees\]](#) Six Degrees of Separation. [online]. [Cited 08 Apr 2011]. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Six_degrees_of_separation
- [\[SPARQL 1.0\]](#) SPARQL Query Language for RDF. [online] [cited 08 Apr 2011]. W3C Recommendation 15 January 2008. W3C © 2006-2007 <http://www.w3.org/TR/rdf-sparql-query/>
- [\[Starr\]](#) Ringo Starr's Wikipedia page. [online] [cited 08 Apr 2011]. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ringo_Starr
- [\[Ringo Starr & His All-Starr Band\]](#) Ringo Starr & His All-Starr Band Wikipedia page. [online] [cited 08 Apr 2011]. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ringo_Starr_%26_His_All-Starr_Band
- [VanDyke and Westgate 2007] VanDyk, John K and Westgate, Matt Pro Drupal Development. ISBN-10: 1590597559. First edition. APress © 2007. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://www.amazon.com/Pro-Drupal-Development-John-VanDyk/dp/1590597559/>
- [\[Virtuoso Universal Server\]](#) OpenLink Virtuoso Universal Server. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://virtuoso.openlinksw.com/>
- [Virtuoso SPARQL Tutorial] Virtuoso SPARQL Tutorial, Part 2. [online]. [cited 08 Apr 2011]. http://virtuoso.openlinksw.com/presentations/SPARQL_Tutorials/SPARQL_Tutorials_Part_2/SPARQL_Tutorials_Part_2.html
- [\[Vocabutek Web Site\]](#) Ron Reck's demo site. [online] [cited 08 Apr 2011]. <http://www.vocabutek.com/>
- [\[Whitburn 2006\]](#) Whitburn, Joel. The Billboard Albums. ISBN-13 0-89820-166-7. Sixth edition. Record Research Inc. © 2006. [Data from 1956-2006; other editions are entitled Top Pop Albums.] <https://www.recordresearch.com>